

# Checklist of Positive and Negative Dialectical Reasoning Arguments/Traits

Name of Student \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

Issue: \_\_\_\_\_

<b>Positive Arguments/Traits</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>Negative Arguments/Traits</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>
Has the student: 1. Defined the problem/issue clearly and accurately?			Has the student: 1. Not clearly defined the issue or his/her position?		
2. Made a value claim which expresses what is right about the claim?			2. Resorted to attacking the person rather than dealing with the issues?		
3. Set out an effective and workable counter claim, or plan?			3. Used circular reasoning rather than providing supporting arguments?		
4. Made arguments, provided reasons, or collected verifiable facts/evidence which supports his/her point of view?			4. Drawn unwarranted or erroneous conclusions, or made faulty inferences, from the evidence presented?		
5. Made claims which are convincing because the consequences are acceptable?			5. Appealed to people's emotions rather than dealing with the issues?		
6. Arranged his/her points, arguments, or facts in structured coherent and logical fashion?			6. Avoided dealing with the arguments, evidence or claims of his/her opponent, rather than attempting to refute them.		
7. Used statistical evidence or expert testimony to justify his/her contentions?			7. Wilfully distorted, misquoted or fabricated statistical or documentary evidence to justify his/her view points?		
8. Proven his/her case on the basis of NEED, worthiness of GOALS, COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGE, or meeting CRITERIA?			8. Heckled the opponent or not acknowledged the worthiness of (counter) arguments?		
9. Acknowledged the existence and worth of counter arguments?			9. Used "flood-gates" or "slippery-slope" arguments?		
10. Asked pertinent, precise and perceptive questions?			10. Not quoted authorities or collected statistical proof to justify his/her position?		
11. Acknowledged or given credit for the sources of his/her research?			11. Made claims or assertions which are not morally or socially acceptable		
12. Convinced a reasonable person that his/her position is more likely true than false.			12. Been unconvincing because his/her claims are not applicable to himself/herself or in other situations?		